

Workshop of Recent Developments in QCD and Quantum Field Theories

November 9-12, 2017 National Taiwan university, Taipei, Taiwan

The chiral magnetic effect

in quark-gluon plasma and condensed matter

D. Kharzeev







Chirality and transport:

classical physics

Chirality and hydrodynamics 240 B.C.





The Archimedes screw

Propeller effect in a fluid



How to rotate the chiral molecule in a fluid?

Use the coupling of an external electric field to the molecule's electric dipole moment!

Rotating electric field – rotating molecule

Baranova, Zel'dovich '78



D.Schamel et al, JACS 135, 12353 (2013)



D.Schamel et al, JACS 135, 12353 (2013)

Life at low Reynolds number

E. M. Purcell

Lyman Laboratory, Harvard University, Cambridge, Massachusetts 02138 (Received 12 June 1976)





E.M.Purcell (1912-1997)

Nobel prize, 1952 (Nuclear Magnetic Resonance)







If Q << 1: Time doesn't matter. The pattern of motion is the same, whether slow or fast, whether forward or backward in time. Stokes equation ("creeping flow")

T-invariance!



Sir G. Stokes (1819-1903)

The Scallop Theorem





Geometry of the gauge field on the space of shapes

A.Shapere, F.Wilczek '88

Need to break T-invariance to move – chirality! Left-handed screw



The propulsion matrix



Chirality imbalance = transport

S.Ayf, I.Cook, DK, to appear

Chirality and vision



Protein-bound retinal molecule as a chiroptical switch: the mechanism of vision chiral photo-pharmacology Chiroptical switching of chiral molecules Need circularly polarized light (CPL), with frequency optimized for inducing the tunnel transition between the enantiomers.



Review: B.Feringa, J. Org. Chem., 2007, 72 (18), pp 6635–6652

Applications: pharmaceutics, "chiral photomedicine", optical data storage and processing, ...



Scientific Background on the Nobel Prize in Chemistry 2016

MOLECULAR MACHINES



J.-P.Sauvage



Sir J.F.Stoddart



B.L. Feringa

Chirality and quantum transport

Chiral anomaly

For massless fermions, the axial current

$$J^A_\mu = \bar{\Psi}\gamma_\mu\gamma_5\Psi = J^R_\mu - J^L_\mu$$

is conserved classically due to the global $U_A(1)$ symmetry:

$$\partial^{\mu}J^{A}_{\mu} = 0$$

However this conservation law is destroyed by quantum effects

S. Adler '69 J. Bell, R. Jackiw ' 69



$$k_{\lambda} \Delta^{\lambda \mu \nu} (k_1, k_2) = a_n \epsilon^{\mu \nu \alpha \beta} k_{1\alpha} k_{2\beta} \qquad a_n = -i/2\pi^2$$
$$\Delta^{\lambda \mu \nu} = a_n \frac{k^{\lambda}}{k^2} \epsilon^{\mu \nu \alpha \beta} k_{1\alpha} k_{2\beta}$$

The chiral anomaly does not vanish at finite mass, and mass corrections have been evaluated, see e.g.

A.D. Dolgov, V.I. Zakharov, Nucl. Phys. B27 (1971) 525 R. Armillis et al, JHEP 0912 (2009) 029 Possibility of anomalous transport in systems with a finite gap (strange quarks, semiconductors)?

$$w_L = -\frac{4i}{s} - \frac{4im^2}{s^2} \log\left(-\frac{s}{m^2}\right) + O(m^3) \quad s \equiv k^2$$

Chiral anomaly





In classical background fields (E and B), chiral anomaly induces a collective motion in the Dirac sea

Chiral Magnetic Effect

K.Fukushima, DK, H.Warringa, PRD'08; Review and list of refs: DK, arXiv:1312.3348

 $\mu_{5} = A_{5}^{0}$

Time derivative

of the axion field!

Chiral chemical potential is formally equivalent to a background chiral gauge field:

In this background, and in the presence of B, vector e.m. current is generated:

$$\partial_{\mu}J^{\mu} = \frac{e^2}{16\pi^2} \left(F_L^{\mu\nu}\tilde{F}_{L,\mu\nu} - F_R^{\mu\nu}\tilde{F}_{R,\mu\nu} \right) \qquad J \qquad \searrow$$

Compute the current through

$$J^{\mu} = rac{\partial \log Z[A_{\mu}, A^5_{\mu}]}{\partial A_{\mu}(x)}$$

The result:

Absent in Maxwell theory!

$$ec{J}=rac{e^2}{2\pi^2}\;\mu_5\;ec{B}$$

Coefficient is fixed by the axial anomaly, no corrections

 μ_5

The same form as found by Vilenkin'80, but no cancelation since the chiral charge is not conserved



arXiv:1105.0385, PRL

Chiral magnetic effect in lattice QCD with chiral chemical potential

Arata Yamamoto

Department of Physics, The University of Tokyo, Tokyo 113-0033, Japan (Dated: May 3, 2011)

We perform a first lattice QCD simulation including two-flavor dynamical fermion with chiral chemical potential. Because the chiral chemical potential gives rise to no sign problem, we can exactly analyze a chirally asymmetric QCD matter by the Monte Carlo simulation. By applying an external magnetic field to this system, we obtain a finite induced current along the magnetic field, which corresponds to the chiral magnetic effect. The obtained induced current is proportional to the magnetic field and to the chiral chemical potential, which is consistent with an analytical prediction.



Chiral magnetic effect as a signature of chiral symmetry restoration



The spontaneous breaking of chiral symmetry does not allow the chiral magnetic current to propagate



Dynamical chiral magnetic effect



A.Rebhan, A.Schmitt, S.Stricker JHEP 0905, 084 (2009), G.Lifshytz, M.Lippert, arXiv:0904.4772; A. Gorsky, P. Kopnin, A. Zayakin, arXiv:1003.2293, A.Gynther, K. Landsteiner, F. Pena Benitez, JHEP 1102 (2011) 110; V. Rubakov, arXiv:1005.1888, C. Hoyos, T. Nishioka, A. O'Bannon, JHEP1110 (2011) 084; ...

CME persists at strong coupling - hydrodynamical formulation?

CME out of equilibrium: chiral kinetic theory

CKT:

M. Stephanov, Y. Yin, PRL109(2012)162001; J.W. Chen, S. Pu, Q. Wang, X.-N.Wang, PRL110(2013)262301; J.W. Chen, T. Ishii, S. Pu, N. Yamamoto, PRD93(2016)125023; ...

AC CME conductivity: why 1/3?

2/3 from Berry phase, 1/3 from energy shift – so at finite frequency expect 2/3 – what is the missing -1/3?

Magnetization current!

DK, M.Stephanov, H.-U.Yee. arXiv:1612.01674; PRD'17



Hydrodynamics and symmetries

- Hydrodynamics: an effective low-energy TOE. States that the response of the fluid to slowly varying perturbations is completely determined by conservation laws (energy, momentum, charge, ...)
- Conservation laws are a consequence of symmetries of the underlying theory
- What happens to hydrodynamics when these symmetries are broken by quantum effects (anomalies of QCD and QED)?

Son, Surowka; Landsteiner, Megias, Pena-Benitez; Sadofyev, Isachenkov; Kalaydzhyan, Kirsch; DK, Yee; Zakharov; Jensen, Loganayagam, Yarom; Neiman, Oz;

No entropy production from P-odd anomalous terms

DK and H.-U. Yee, 1105.6360; PRD

Mirror reflection: entropy decreases ?

$$\partial_{\mu}s^{\mu} \le 0$$

Decrease is ruled out by 2nd law of thermodynamics

Allows to compute analytically 13 out of 18 anomalous transport coefficients in 2nd order relativistic hydrodynamics

Entropy grows

 $\partial_{\mu}s^{\mu} \ge 0$



The CME in relativistic hydrodynamics: The Chiral Magnetic Wave

$$\vec{j}_{V} = \frac{N_{c} \ e}{2\pi^{2}} \mu_{A} \vec{B}; \quad \vec{j}_{A} = \frac{N_{c} \ e}{2\pi^{2}} \mu_{V} \vec{B},$$
CME Chiral separation
$$\begin{pmatrix} \vec{j}_{V} \\ \vec{j}_{A} \end{pmatrix} = \frac{N_{c} \ e \vec{B}}{2\pi^{2}} \begin{pmatrix} 0 & 1 \\ 1 & 0 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} \mu_{V} \\ \mu_{A} \end{pmatrix}$$
Propagating chiral wave: (if chiral symmetry is restored)

$$\left(\partial_0 \mp \frac{N_c e B \alpha}{2\pi^2} \partial_1 - D_L \partial_1^2\right) j_{L,R}^0 = 0$$

DK, H.-U. Yee, arXiv:1012.6026 [hep-th]; PRD



Gapless collective mode is the carrier of CME current in MHD:

$$\omega = \mp v_{\chi}k - iD_Lk^2 + \cdots$$

29

The Chiral Magnetic Wave: oscillations of electric and chiral charges coupled by the chiral anomaly In strong magnetic field, CMW propagates with the speed of light!





DK, H.-U. Yee, Phys Rev D'11 ³⁰

M. Mace, N. Mueller, S. Schlichting, S. Sharma, arxiv:1704.05887; PRD'17 Chiral Magnetic Wave in real time!



Static U(1) magnetic field in z-dir

Chiral Magnetohydrodynamics (CMHD)



Y.Hirono, T.Hirano, DK, (Stony Brook – Tokyo), arxiv:1412.0311 (3+1) ideal CMHD (Chiral MagnetoHydroDynamics)

BEST Theory Collaboration (DOE)



Is there a way to observe CME in nuclear collisions at RHIC and LHC?



Heavy ion collisions as a source of the strongest magnetic fields available in the Laboratory



Fig. A.2. Magnetic field at the center of a gold-gold collision, for different impact parameters. Here the center of mass energy is 200 GeV per nucleon pair ($Y_0 = 5.4$).

Comparison of magnetic fields



0.6 Gauss The Earths magnetic field 100 Gauss A common, hand-held magnet 4.5 x 10⁵ Gauss The strongest steady magnetic fields achieved so far in the laboratory 10⁷ Gauss The strongest man-made fields ever achieved, if only briefly 10¹³ Gauss Typical surface, polar magnetic fields of radio pulsars 10¹⁵ Gauss Surface field of Magnetars



http://solomon.as.utexas.edu/~duncan/magnetar.html Heavy ion collisions: the strongest magnetic field ever achieved in the laboratory Off central Gold-Gold Collisions at 100 GeV per nucleon $e B(\tau=0.2 \text{ fm}) = 10^3 \sim 10^4 \text{ MeV}^2 \sim 10^{17} \text{ Gauss}$



Charge asymmetry w.r.t. reaction plane as a signature of chirality imbalance Electric dipole moment due to chiral imbalance



DK, hep-ph/0406125; Phys.Lett.B633(2006)260



$$\begin{split} \gamma &\equiv \langle \cos(\phi_{\alpha} + \phi_{\beta} - 2\Psi_{\rm RP}) \rangle = \langle \cos \Delta \phi_{\alpha} \, \cos \Delta \phi_{\beta} \rangle - \langle \sin \Delta \phi_{\alpha} \, \sin \Delta \phi_{\beta} \rangle \\ &= [\langle v_{1,\alpha} v_{1,\beta} \rangle + B_{\rm IN}] - [\langle a_{\alpha} a_{\beta} \rangle + B_{\rm OUT}] \approx - \langle a_{\alpha} a_{\beta} \rangle + [B_{\rm IN} - B_{\rm OUT}], \end{split}$$

NB: P-even quantity (strength of P-odd fluctuations) – subject to large background contributions

Observation of charge-dependent azimuthal correlations in pPb collisions and its implication for the search for the

chiral magnetic effect



The CMS Collaboration*



arxiv:1610.00263 October 2, 2016

Background everywhere? (dAu at RHIC!)

Magnetic field in pA?

Figure 2: In (a), the same sign (SS) and opposite sign (OS) three-particle correlator averaged over $|\eta_{\alpha} - \eta_{\beta}| < 1.6$ as a function of $N_{\text{trk}}^{\text{offline}}$ in pPb and PbPb collisions at $\sqrt{s_{_{NN}}} = 5.02$ TeV are shown. In (b), the same correlation as a function of centrality is presented in PbPb collisions at $\sqrt{s_{_{NN}}} = 5.02$ TeV from CMS, at $\sqrt{s_{_{NN}}} = 2.76$ TeV from ALICE, and in AuAu collisions at $\sqrt{s_{_{NN}}} = 0.2$ TeV from STAR. Statistical and systematic uncertainties are indicated by the error bars and shaded regions, respectively.

Challenges to the chiral magnetic wave using charge-dependent azimuthal anisotropies in pPb and PbPb collisions at $\sqrt{s_{_{\rm NN}}} = 5.02 \, {\rm TeV}$

arXiv:1708.08901

The CMS Collaboration* CMS $185 \le N_{trk}^{offline} < 220$ $\binom{v^{-}}{2} - \frac{v^{+}}{2}\binom{v^{-}}{2} + \frac{v^{+}}{2}$.3 < p_ < 3.0 GeV/c r₂norm PbPb 0.108 ± 0.005 pPb 0.149 ± 0.008 -0.050.05 O A^{true}

Important data that challenges all existing theoretical models!

Is there a way to get a conclusive answer?

Chiral Magnetic Effect Task Force Report

Vladimir Skokov (co-chair),^{1,*} Paul Sorensen (co-chair),^{2,†} Volker Koch,³ Soeren Schlichting,² Jim Thomas,³ Sergei Voloshin,⁴ Gang Wang,⁵ and Ho-Ung Yee^{6,1} arxiv:1608.00982

The unique identification of the chiral magnetic effect in heavy-ion collisions would represent one of the highlights of the RHIC physics program and would provide a lasting legacy for the field. The current plan for completing the RHIC mission envisions a second phase of RHIC. We have specifically investigated the case for colliding nuclear isobars (nuclei with the same mass but different charge) and find the case compelling. We recommend that a program of nuclear isobar collisions to isolate the chiral magnetic effect from background sources be placed as a high priority item in the strategy for completing the RHIC mission.

Approved dedicated Spring 2018 CME run at RHIC with Zr (Z=40), Ru (Z=44) isobars – a clear, "yes or no" answer

The effect of vorticity: Λ polarization



STAR Coll., Nature 2017

Chiral fermions in Dirac & Weyl semimetals

SOVIET PHYSICS JETP

VOLUME 32, NUMBER 4

APRIL, 1971

POSSIBLE EXISTENCE OF SUBSTANCES INTERMEDIATE BETWEEN METALS AND DIELECTRICS

A. A. ABRIKOSOV and S. D. BENESLAVSKII

L. D. Landau Institute of Theoretical Physics

Submitted April 13, 1970

Zh. Eksp. Teor. Fiz. 59, 1280-1298 (October, 1970)

The question of the possible existence of substances having an electron spectrum without any energy gap and, at the same time, not possessing a Fermi surface is investigated. First of all the question of the possibility of contact of the conduction band and the valence band at a single point is investigated within the framework of the one-electron problem. It is shown that the symmetry conditions for the crystal admit of such a possibility. A complete investigation is carried out for points in reciprocal lattice space with a little group which is equivalent to a point group, and an example of a more complicated little group is considered. It is shown that in the neighborhood of the point of contact the spectrum may be linear as well as quadratic.









Scientific Background on the Nobel Prize in Physics 2016

TOPOLOGICAL PHASE TRANSITIONS AND TOPOLOGICAL PHASES OF MATTER

The discovery of Dirac and Weyl semimetals – 3D chiral materials



Z.K.Liu et al., Science 343 p.864 (Feb 21, 2014)

CME in condensed matter:

Observation of the chiral magnetic effect in ZrTe₅

Qiang Li,¹ Dmitri E. Kharzeev,^{2,3} Cheng Zhang,¹ Yuan Huang,⁴ I. Pletikosić,^{1,5} A. V. Fedorov,⁶ R. D. Zhong,¹ J. A. Schneeloch,¹ G. D. Gu,¹ and T. Valla¹

BNL - Stony Brook - Princeton - Berkeley



arXiv:1412.6543 [cond-mat.str-el]

Observation of the chiral magnetic effect in ZrTe₅

Qiang Li,¹ Dmitri E. Kharzeev,^{2,3} Cheng Zhang,¹ Yuan Huang,⁴ I. Pletikosić,^{1,5} A. V. Fedorov,⁶ R. D. Zhong,¹ J. A. Schneeloch,¹ G. D. Gu,¹ and T. Valla¹



arXiv:1412.6543 (December 2014); Nature Physics 12, 550 (2016)

Observation of the chiral magnetic effect in ZrTe₅

Qiang Li,¹ Dmitri E. Kharzeev,^{2,3} Cheng Zhang,¹ Yuan Huang,⁴ I. Pletikosić,^{1,5}

A. V. Fedorov,⁶ R. D. Zhong,¹ J. A. Schneeloch,¹ G. D. Gu,¹ and T. Valla¹

Put the crystal in parallel E, B fields – the anomaly generates chiral charge:

$$\frac{d\rho_5}{dt} = \frac{e^2}{4\pi^2\hbar^2c}\vec{E}\cdot\vec{B} - \frac{\rho_5}{\tau_V}$$

and thus the chiral chemical potential:

$$\mu_5 = \frac{3}{4} \frac{v^3}{\pi^2} \frac{e^2}{\hbar^2 c} \frac{\vec{E} \cdot \vec{B}}{T^2 + \frac{\mu^2}{\pi^2}} \tau_V.$$

Observation of the chiral magnetic effect in ZrTe₅

Qiang Li,¹ Dmitri E. Kharzeev,^{2,3} Cheng Zhang,¹ Yuan Huang,⁴ I. Pletikosić,^{1,5}
A. V. Fedorov,⁶ R. D. Zhong,¹ J. A. Schneeloch,¹ G. D. Gu,¹ and T. Valla¹
so that there is a chiral magnetic current:

$$\vec{J}_{\rm CME} = \frac{e^2}{2\pi^2} \ \mu_5 \ \vec{B}.$$

resulting in the quadratic dependence of CME conductivity on B:

 $J_{\rm CME}^{i} = \frac{e^2}{\pi\hbar} \frac{3}{8} \frac{e^2}{\hbar c} \frac{v^3}{\pi^3} \frac{\tau_V}{T^2 + \frac{\mu^2}{\pi^2}} B^i B^k E^k \equiv \sigma_{\rm CME}^{ik} E^k.$ adding the Ohmic one – negative magnetoresistance

Chiral Magnetic Effect Generates Quantum Current

Separating left- and right-handed particles in a semi-metallic material produces anomalously high conductivity



Qiang Li's Distinguished CQM lecture at Simons Center, Feb 19, 2016 50 on video:

http://scgp.stonybrook.edu/video_portal/video.php?id=2458

Nature Physics **12**, 550 (2016)

Chiral magnetic effect in Dirac/Weyl semimetals



- ZrTe₅ Q. Li, D. Kharzeev, et al (BNL and Stony Brook Univ.) arXiv:**1412.6543**; doi:10.1038/NPHYS3648
- Na₃Bi J. Xiong, N. P. Ong et al (Princeton Univ.) arxiv:**1503.08179**; Science 350:413,2015

Cd₃As₂- C. Li et al (Peking Univ. China) arxiv:**1504.07398**; Nature Commun. 6, 10137 (2015).



- TaAs X. Huang et al (IOP, China) arxiv:1503.01304; Phys. Rev. X 5, 031023
- NbAs X. Yang et al (Zhejiang Univ. China) arxiv:1506.02283
- NbP Z. Wang et al (Zhejiang Univ. China) arxiv:1504.07398
- TaP Shekhar, C. Felser, B. Yang et al (MPI-Dresden) arxiv:1506.06577

Bi_{1-x}Sb_x at $x \approx 0.03$ - Kim, et al. "Dirac versus Weyl Fermions in Topological Insulators: Adler-Bell-Jackiw Anomaly in Transport Phenomena. Phys. Rev. Lett., 111, 246603 (2013).



Negative MR in TaAs₂



Y.Luo et al, 1601.05524

Nonlocal chiral transport

C.Zhang et al, Nature Comm.'17 DOI: 10.1038/ncomms13741 S.Parameswaran, T.Grover, D.Abanin, D.Pesin, A.Vishwanath PRX4, 031035 (2014)





 $|V_{\rm NL}(x)| \propto V_{\rm SD} e^{-\frac{L}{L_{\rm v}}}$

CME as a new type of superconductivity

 $\vec{\mathbf{E}} = \lambda^2 \vec{\mathbf{J}}$

London theory of superconductors, '35:

$$\vec{\mathbf{J}} = -\lambda^{-2}\vec{\mathbf{A}} \qquad \nabla \cdot \vec{\mathbf{A}} = 0$$

Fritz and Heinz London consider a micro-device of $O(\mu m)$ size, so that Chirality is conserved; then

$$\mu_5 \sim \vec{E}\vec{B} \ t$$

superconducting current, tunable by magnetic field!

for $ec{E} || ec{B}$

CME:

DK, arXiv:1612.05677

 $\vec{\mathbf{E}} = -\vec{\mathbf{A}}$

 $\vec{J} \sim \mu_5 \vec{B}$



 $\vec{E} \sim B^{-2} \vec{J}$



Chiral photonics

Faraday rotation due to surface states in $(Bi_{1-x}Sb_x)_2Te_3$ topological insulator

Y. M. Shao^{1,*}, K. W. Post,¹, J. S. Wu¹, S. Dai¹, A. J. Frenzel¹, A. R. Richardella², J. S. Lee², N. Samarth², M. M. Fogler¹, A. V. Balatsky^{3,4}, D. E. Kharzeev^{5,6} and D. N. Basov¹ ¹Physics Department, University of California-San Diego, La Jolla, California 92093, USA
²Department of Physics, The Pennsylvania State University, University Park, Pennsylvania 16802, USA ³Nordita, KTH Royal Institute of Technology and Stockholm University, Roslagstullsbacken 23, SE-106 91 Stockholm, Sweden
⁴Institute for Materials Science, Los Alamos National Laboratory, Los Alamos, New Mexico 87545, USA ⁵Department of Physics, Brookhaven National Laboratory, Upton, New York 11794-3800, USA





Nano Letters, 2017

Response of surface states grows linearly in B (chiral anomaly)

$$\vec{\nabla} \cdot \vec{E} = \rho + c \vec{P} \cdot \vec{B}$$

Rotation of light polarization on axion domain walls in the Universe? currents from time-dependent axion fields?

Detection of sub-MeV Dark Matter with Three-Dimensional Dirac Materials

Yonit Hochberg^{1,2}, Yonatan Kahn³, Mariangela Lisanti³, Kathryn M. Zurek^{4,5}, Adolfo G. Grushin^{6,7}, Roni Ilan⁸, Sinéad M. Griffin^{6,9}, Zhen-Fei Liu^{6,9}, Sophie F. Weber^{6,9}, and Jeffrey B. Neaton^{6,9,10,11}



Figure 4: Projected reach of dark matter scattering in Dirac materials through a light kinetically mixed dark photon mediator with in-medium effects included. We show the expected background-free 95% C.L. sensitivity (3.0 events) that can be obtained with 1 kg-yr exposure. For the two

Summary



Reviews:

DK, K. Landsteiner, A. Schmitt, H.U.Yee (Eds), "Strongly interacting matter in magnetic fields", Springer, 2013; arxiv:1211.6245

DK, "The chiral magnetic effect and anomaly-induced transport", Prog.Part.Nucl.Phys. 75 (2014) 133; arxiv: 1312.3348

DK, "Topology, magnetic field and strongly interacting matter", arxiv: 1501.01336; Ann. Rev. Nucl. Part. Science (2015)

DK, J.Liao, S.Voloshin, G.Wang, "Chiral magnetic and vortical effects in high-energy nuclear collisions: A status report" Prog. Part. Nucl. Phys. 88 (2016) 1